

Jesus: Myth vs Reality

Marie Seshat Landry

June 7, 2025

Abstract

This paper examines the historicity of Jesus of Nazareth by contrasting the mythicist claims against the mainstream scholarly consensus. Through analysis of early Christian texts, non-Christian attestations, archaeological evidence, and methodological criteria from historiography, it argues that while supernatural elements are theological constructs, the core existence of a historical Jesus is well supported by independent sources.

1 Introduction

Debates over the historicity of Jesus of Nazareth have persisted for centuries. A vocal fringe known as the Christ-myth theory contends that Jesus never existed as a flesh-and-blood individual and that all accounts stem from myth-making processes. This paper aims to assess the evidence for and against the existence of a historical Jesus and to distinguish theological embellishments from probable historical fact.

2 Literature Review

2.1 Mainstream Scholarly Position

Nearly all historians of antiquity agree that Jesus existed as a Jewish preacher in 1st-century Palestine. Ehrman (2012) asserts that "virtually every competent scholar of antiquity, Christian or non-Christian, agrees" on Jesus's historicity. Bauckham (2017) uses multiple attestation and criterion of embarrassment to reconstruct a reliable portrait of the historical Jesus.

2.2 Mythicist Perspectives

Key proponents of mythicism include Earl Doherty (1999) and Richard Carrier (2014), who argue that Gospel narratives derive from pagan mythic patterns and that early Christianity worshiped a purely spiritual Christ. These views, however, remain marginal within academic circles.

3 Methodological Framework

Historians rely on several criteria to evaluate ancient figures:

- **Multiple Attestation:** Independent sources pointing to the same event or person.
- **Criterion of Embarrassment:** Details unlikely to be invented for theological expediency.
- **Independent, Hostile Testimony:** Accounts from sources with no vested interest.

4 Evidence for the Historical Jesus

4.1 Early Christian Texts

Pauline Epistles (c. 50–60 CE) refer to Jesus's brother James and name eyewitnesses such as Peter and the Twelve (**paul_1Cor**). These letters predate the Gospels and present a living tradition of Jesus's recent existence.

4.2 Non-Christian Attestations

Josephus (c. 93 CE) describes Jesus as "a wise man... condemned... by Pilate to the cross" in *Antiquities* 18.3.3 (**josephus_Antiquities**). Tacitus (c. 116 CE) references "Christus... suffered the extreme penalty... at the hands of Pontius Pilatus" when chronicling Nero's persecution (**tacitus_Annals**).

4.3 Archaeological and Papyrological Data

The Rylands Papyrus P52, dated to 100–150 CE, contains portions of the Gospel of John, indicating rapid textual transmission of Jesus traditions (**p52_Florence**).

5 Myth vs Theological Embellishment

5.1 Miracles and Virgin Birth

Miracle accounts and the virgin-birth narratives appear only in the later Gospels (Matthew and Luke) and are absent from Paul and Mark. Scholars view these as theological motifs intended to affirm Jesus's divine status rather than historical reportage (**wright_Christology**).

5.2 Development of the Christ-Myth Theory

The mythicist position gained traction in the 19th century alongside comparative religion studies but failed to meet the methodological rigor demanded by modern historiography. Contemporary mythicists emphasize parallels with Greco-Roman myths, yet offer no early textual evidence for a purely mythical Christ.

6 Discussion

Assessing the weight of converging evidence shows that while supernatural claims belong to theology, the existence of Jesus as a historical figure is supported by:

1. Early attestations within 20–30 years of his life (Paul).
2. Independent, hostile witnesses (Tacitus, Josephus).
3. Rapid written transmission (papyrus fragments by 150 CE).

Mythicist arguments, based on silence and comparative mythology, cannot outweigh positive attestation from diverse sources.

7 Conclusion

The evidence indicates that Jesus of Nazareth existed as an itinerant Jewish teacher and was crucified under Pontius Pilate. Supernatural aspects—miracles, virgin birth—are later theological developments. Consequently, the "myth" lies in the embellished Christ of faith, while the "reality" pertains to a historical man whose life catalyzed a transformative movement.